City Of York Council	Extract from Committee Minutes
Meeting	Customer and Corporate Services Scrutiny Management Committee
Date	11 March 2019
Present	Councillors Williams (Chair), Galvin (Vice- Chair), N Barnes, D'Agorne, Douglas, Fenton, Gates, Looker and Reid

## Part B - Matters Referred To Council

## 53. Scrutiny Operations and Functions Review - Draft Final Report

[See also under Part A]

Members considered a Draft Final Report which presented them with information gathered by the Task Group set up to undertake a review of scrutiny operations and functions, together with its conclusions and recommendations.

During discussion of the report, and the review more widely, Members stressed that the proposed recommendations were not controversial, but a key conclusion was that a cultural change within CYC was needed if Scrutiny is to function more effectively moving forward.

One Member felt that removing pre-decision call-in was a mistake, as no replacement for this function had been proposed in the report. Other Members felt strongly that, whilst well intentioned, pre-decision call-in had proved a frustrating process. They stated that 'Calling-in' an item was considered adversarial and that, if Members were involved at an early stage, and scrutiny was working effectively, this function was not necessary.

The Committee acknowledged that whilst scrutiny was 'owned' by Members, the review had been concerned with achieving greater engagement with the whole process by all. Finally, they commented that the move to monthly meetings would allow Members the time to engage with topics earlier and in greater depth.

The Committee thanked those Members involved in the Task Group and the Officers who had supported them.

Recommendation: That Council approve the following changes, in line with constitutional requirements:

- i. That the Health, Housing and Adult Social Care Policy and Scrutiny Committee be split into:
  - Health and Adult Social Care policy and Scrutiny Committee; and
  - Housing and Safer Neighbourhoods Policy and Scrutiny Committee.

Reason: The Committee's extended remit is too large to allow effective scrutiny.

ii. That the Economy and Place Policy Development and Scrutiny Committees are rejoined.

Reason: To end the uncertainty around the roles of each committee and to provide Economy and Place with a comprehensive scrutiny function.

iii. That the Pre-Decision Call-In process be removed from the Constitution.

Reason: To encourage a more timely and pro-active approach to pre-decision scrutiny.

Councillor Dafydd Williams, Chair [The meeting started at 5.35 pm and finished at 6.50 pm].